# Large deviations probabilities and moderate deviations in random matrix theory 

Peter Eichelsbacher<br>Ruhr-University Bochum (RUB)

Darmstadt, July 2014

## Menu

- Objects: certain statistics in random matrix theory
- Question: moderate deviations and large deviations probabilities
- GUE ensembles, Wigner matrices, invariant ensembles
- local and global statistics
- Four Moment Theorem
- bounds on cumultants, method of orthogonal polynomials


## Wigner matrices

- random Hermitian matrices $M_{n}$ of size $n$
- for $i<j$ : the real and imaginary parts of $\left(M_{n}\right)_{i j}$ are iid, with mean 0 and variance $1 / 2$
- $\left(M_{n}\right)_{i i}$ are iid with mean 0 and variance 1
example: entries are Gaussian:
Gaussian Unitary Ensemble (GUE)


## condition (C) on $M_{n}$

$M_{n}$ satisfies condition (C) if :

- the real part $\xi$ and the imaginary part $\tilde{\xi}$ of $\left(M_{n}\right)_{i j}$ are independent
- and have an exponential decay: there are two constants $C$ and $C^{\prime}$ such that

$$
P\left(\xi \geq t^{C}\right) \leq e^{-t} \quad \text { and } \quad P\left(\tilde{\xi} \geq t^{C}\right) \leq e^{-t}
$$

for all $t \geq C^{\prime}$
can possibly be relaxed (not necessarily identically distributed; finite moment condition: $\mathbb{E}|\xi|^{C}, \mathbb{E}|\widetilde{\xi}|^{C}<\infty$ for $C$ suff. large)

## known results

GUE: the joint law of the eigenvalues is known
allowing for a lot of descriptions of their limiting behavior both in the global and local regimes

$$
W_{n}:=\frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} M_{n}, \quad A_{n}:=\sqrt{n} M_{n} \quad \text { coarse/fine-scale }
$$

$W_{n}$ : placing all eigenvalues in a bounded interval ( $[-2,2]$ )
$A_{n}$ : keeping the spacing between adjacent eigenvalues to be roughly of unit size

## known results

$\lambda_{1} \leq \lambda_{2} \leq \cdots \leq \lambda_{n}$ : eigenvalues of $W_{n}$
(global) Wigner theorem:
(under substantially more general hypotheses true)
$\frac{1}{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \delta_{\lambda_{j}}$ converges weakly almost surely as $n \rightarrow \infty$ to law

$$
\varrho(t)=\frac{1}{2 \pi} \sqrt{4-t^{2}} 1_{[-2,2]}
$$

$I \subset \mathbb{R}:$

$$
\frac{1}{n} N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right):=\frac{1}{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} 1_{\left\{\lambda_{j} \in I\right\}} \rightarrow \varrho(I) \quad \text { a.s. }
$$

## fluctuation level: global

GUE: $M_{n}^{\prime}, W_{n}^{\prime}:=\frac{1}{\sqrt{n}} M_{n}^{\prime}$
Theorem (Costin-Lebowitz; 1995)
Let $I_{n}$ be an intervall and $\mathbb{V}\left(N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right) \rightarrow \infty$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$, then

$$
\frac{N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)-\mathbb{E}\left(N_{l_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right)}{\sqrt{\mathbb{V}\left(N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right)}} \rightarrow N(0,1)
$$

in distribution.
applying orthogonal polynomial techniques and/or the particular determinantal structure of GUE

## wave of results

It has been conjectured, since the 1960s, by Wigner, Dyson, Mehta and many others, that the local statistics (the convergence of distribution functions) are universal, in the sense that they hold not only for the GUE, but for any other Wigner random matrix also.

Erdös, Schlein, Yau / Tao, Vu, 2009/2010/2011...

## statistics

local:

- distribution of the gaps between consecutive eigenvalues: how many $1 \leq i \leq n$ are there such that $\lambda_{i+1}-\lambda_{i} \leq s \quad$ ?
- k-point correlation functions
- distribution of individual $\lambda_{i}$

Gaudin, sin-kernel due to Dyson, Tracy-Widom

What about large and moderate deviations (global/local)?
(joint work with H. Döring, Th. Kriecherbauer, K. Schüler)

## large deviations (LDP): i.i.d. summands

$\left(X_{i}\right)_{i}$ i.i.d.

$$
\begin{gathered}
S_{n}:=\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{i} \\
P\left(S_{n} \sim x\right)
\end{gathered}=\exp (-n I(x)) \text {. }
$$

with rate function

$$
I(x)=\sup _{z \in \mathbb{R}}\left\{z x-\log E e^{z X_{1}}\right\}
$$

large deviations: Cramér...

## moderate deviations (MDP): iid summands

$\left(X_{i}\right)_{i}$ i.i.d.

$$
\begin{gathered}
S_{n}^{a_{n}}:=\frac{1}{a_{n} \sqrt{n}} \sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{i} \quad \text { with } \quad 1 \ll a_{n} \ll \sqrt{n} \\
P\left(S_{n}^{a_{n}} \sim x\right) \approx \exp \left(-a_{n}^{2} I(x)\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

with rate function

$$
I(x)=\frac{x^{2}}{2 \mathbb{V}\left(X_{1}\right)}
$$

moderate deviations
some universality

## (global) deviation results for spectral statistics

- LDP and MDP for empirical measures of eigenvalues in the Gaussian case
- LDP and MDP for empirical measures of eigenvalues for special Gaussian divisible ensembles:

$$
(1-t)^{1 / 2} M_{n}^{\prime}+t^{1 / 2} V_{n}
$$

$V_{n}$ deterministic selfadjoint matrix with convergent spectral measure Ben Arous, Guionnet, Dembo, 1997, 2002,...

- LDP for empirical measures for other symmetries
E., Stolz, 2007, 2011
- traces of powers of Bernoulli random matrices Döring, E., 2009
no universal version for WIgNER matrices!


## first result

Let $\mathbb{V}\left(N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right) \rightarrow \infty$ :
Theorem (GUE, H. Döring, P.E., 2013, ALEA)
For any $\left(a_{n}\right)_{n}$ with $1 \ll a_{n} \ll \sqrt{\mathbb{V}\left(N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right)}$

$$
\frac{N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)-\mathbb{E}\left(N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right)}{a_{n} \sqrt{\mathbb{V}\left(N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right)}}
$$

satisfies a MDP with speed $a_{n}^{2}$ and rate function $x^{2} / 2$.
consider cumulants or log-LAPLACE transform; use determinantal structure of GUE
also: large deviations probabilities of Cramér type

## version with numerics

Gustavsson, 2005, showed: for $I=[y, \infty)$ with $y \in(-2,2)$

$$
\mathbb{E}\left[N_{l}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right]=n \varrho(I)+O\left(\frac{\log n}{n}\right) \quad \text { and } \quad \mathbb{V}\left(N_{l}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right)=\left(\frac{1}{2 \pi^{2}}+o(1)\right) \log n
$$

applying strong asymptotics for orthogonal polynomials with respect to exponential weights due to Deift et. al.
hence

$$
\frac{N_{l}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)-n \varrho(I)}{a_{n} \sqrt{\frac{1}{2 \pi^{2}} \log n}}
$$

satisfies the same MDP

## universal MDP (global)

main result:

## Theorem (H. Döring, P.E., 2013, ALEA)

Let $M_{n}$ be a Wigner matrix whose entries satisfy condition (C) and match the corresponding entries of GUE up to order 4. Let $I=I(y)=[y, \infty)$ for $y \in(-2,2)$. For any $\left(a_{n}\right)_{n}$ with $1 \ll a_{n} \ll \sqrt{\mathbb{V}\left(N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)\right)}$

$$
\frac{N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)-\mathbb{E}\left(N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)\right)}{a_{n} \sqrt{\mathbb{V}\left(N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)\right)}}
$$

satisfies a MDP with speed $a_{n}^{2}$ and rate function $x^{2} / 2$.
the same is true for $I_{n}=\left[y_{n}, \infty\right)$ with $y_{n} \rightarrow 2^{-}$and $n\left(2-y_{n}\right)^{3 / 2} \rightarrow \infty$ (result at the edge of the spectrum)

## matching 4 moments

complex random variables $X$ and $Y$ match to order $k$ if

$$
\mathbb{E}\left[\operatorname{Re}(X)^{m} \operatorname{Im}(X)^{\prime}\right]=\mathbb{E}\left[\operatorname{Re}(Y)^{m} \operatorname{Im}(Y)^{\prime}\right]
$$

for all $m, I \geq 0$ such that $m+I \leq k$.
matching the corresponding entries of GUE up to order 4: fix third and fourth moment

## moderate deviations for a local statistic

on the way proving our result:
let $t(x) \in[-2,2]$ defined for $x \in[0,1]$ by

$$
x=\int_{-2}^{t(x)} d \varrho(t)
$$

consider $i=i(n)$ such that $i / n \rightarrow a \in(0,1): \quad \lambda_{i}$ is in the bulk
$t(i / n)$ : expected location of the $i$-th eigenvalue

$$
\frac{\sqrt{\log n}}{\pi \sqrt{2}} \frac{1}{n \varrho(t(i / n))}
$$

standard deviation (mean eigenvalue spacing)

## GUE and Wigner

## Theorem

Let $i / n \rightarrow a \in(0,1), 1 \ll a_{n} \ll \sqrt{\log n}$. Let $W_{n}$ be a Wigner matrix whose entries satisfy a finite moment condition and match the corresponding entries of GUE up to order 4. Then

$$
\sqrt{\frac{4-t(i / n)^{2}}{2}} \frac{\lambda_{i}\left(W_{n}\right)-t(i / n)}{a_{n} \frac{\sqrt{\log n}}{n}}
$$

satisfies a MDP with speed $a_{n}^{2}$ and rate function $x^{2} / 2$.
Gustavsson: CLT, GUE
a similar result follows at the edge of the spectrum: $i / n \rightarrow 0$ for $i=i(n) \rightarrow \infty$

$$
\frac{\lambda_{n-i}\left(W_{n}\right)-\left(2-\left(\frac{3 \pi}{2} \frac{i}{n}\right)^{2 / 3}\right)}{a_{n}\left(\frac{\log i}{i^{2 / 3} n^{4 / 3}}\right)^{1 / 2}}
$$

## proof

(1): GUE: transfer the $N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)-\mathrm{MDP}$ to $\lambda_{i}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)$ :
use the tight relation: for $I(y)=[y, \infty)$

$$
N_{l(y)}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right) \leq n-i \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \lambda_{i}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right) \leq y
$$

## proof

(1): GUE: transfer the $N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)-$ MDP to $\lambda_{i}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)$ :
use the tight relation: for $I(y)=[y, \infty)$

$$
\left.\begin{array}{c}
N_{l(y)}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right) \leq n-i \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \lambda_{i}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right) \leq y \\
I_{n}:=\left[t(i / n)+\xi a_{n} \frac{\sqrt{\log n}}{n} \frac{\sqrt{2}}{\sqrt{4-t(i / n)^{2}}}, \infty\right) \\
P_{n}\left(\frac{\lambda_{i}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)-t(i / n)}{a_{n} \frac{\sqrt{\log n}}{n}} \leq \xi\right)=P_{n}\left(N_{l_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right) \leq n-i\right) \\
=\quad P_{n}\left(\frac{\sqrt{2}}{\sqrt{4-t(i / n)^{2}}}\right. \\
=\quad N_{n}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)-\mathbb{E}\left[N_{l_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right] \\
\left.a_{n}\left(N_{l_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right)\right)^{1 / 2}
\end{array} \frac{n-i-\mathbb{E}\left[N_{l_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right]}{a_{n}\left(\mathbb{V}\left(N_{l_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right)\right)^{1 / 2}}\right) .
$$

## asymptotics

remember:

$$
\mathbb{E}\left[N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right]=n \varrho\left(I_{n}\right)+O\left(\frac{\log n}{n}\right)
$$

here: $I_{n}$ depends on $a_{n}$ and with strong asymptotics for orthogonal polynomials

$$
n \varrho\left(I_{n}\right)=n-i-\xi a_{n}(\log n)^{1 / 2} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2} \pi}+O\left(\frac{a_{n}^{2} \log n}{n}\right)
$$

## asymptotics

remember:

$$
\mathbb{E}\left[N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right]=n \varrho\left(I_{n}\right)+O\left(\frac{\log n}{n}\right)
$$

here: $I_{n}$ depends on $a_{n}$ and with strong asymptotics for orthogonal polynomials

$$
n \varrho\left(I_{n}\right)=n-i-\xi a_{n}(\log n)^{1 / 2} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2} \pi}+O\left(\frac{a_{n}^{2} \log n}{n}\right)
$$

moreover we apply

$$
\mathbb{V}\left(N_{I_{n}}\left(W_{n}^{\prime}\right)\right)=\left(\frac{1}{2 \pi^{2}}+o(1)\right) \log n
$$

## proof

(2): next transfer the local MDP universally: apply the Four Moment Theorem:

## Theorem (TAO, Vu)

Let $M_{n}$ be Wigner whose entries satisfy a moment condition and match the corresponding entries of GUE up to order 4. Then there is a small constant $c_{0}$ such that

$$
P\left(\lambda_{i}\left(A_{n}^{\prime}\right) \in I_{-}\right)-n^{-c_{0}} \leq P\left(\lambda_{i}\left(A_{n}\right) \in I\right) \leq P\left(\lambda_{i}\left(A_{n}^{\prime}\right) \in I_{+}\right)+n^{-c_{0}}
$$

and

$$
\frac{1}{a_{n}^{2}} \log n^{-c_{0}} \rightarrow-\infty
$$

by assumption

## proof

(3): reverse strategy to go back to $N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)$
(3): reverse strategy to go back to $N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)$

- deep fact: $\mathbb{E}\left(N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)\right)$ and $\mathbb{V}\left(N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)\right)$ have identical asymptotic behaviour to the ones for GUE matrices!
- Unfortunately, the Four Moment Theorem does not give this!
- Indeed, the Four Moment Theorem deals with a finite number of eigenvalues, whereas the computation of $\mathbb{E}\left(N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)\right)$ and $\mathbb{V}\left(N_{l}\left(W_{n}\right)\right)$ involves all the eigenvalues of the matrix
- To achieve the result one can apply recent results by Erdös, Yau and Yin providing suitable localization properties of the eigenvalues in the bulk: therefore need assumption (C)


## determinant

$M_{n}^{\prime}$ GUE:

$$
W_{n}^{\prime}:=\frac{\log \left|\operatorname{det} M_{n}^{\prime}\right|-\frac{1}{n} \log n+\frac{n}{2}}{\sqrt{\frac{1}{2} \log n}}
$$

we are able to bound the $j$ th cumulant $\kappa_{j}$ of $W_{n}^{\prime}$

$$
\kappa_{j} \leq \text { const. } \frac{j!}{\Delta^{j-2}}
$$

with $\Delta=c_{j} \sigma$ for a certain constant $c$ and apply moderate deviations via culumants (Rudzkid, Saulis, Statuljavicus, 1978), see H. Döring, P.E., 2013, JTP:

## determinant

## Theorem (H. Döring, P.E., 2013, GöTZe proceed.)

(1) Cramér-type large deviations probabilities: There exists two constants $C_{1}$ and $C_{2}$ such that:

$$
\left|\log \frac{P\left(W_{n}^{\prime} \geq x\right)}{1-\Phi(x)}\right| \leq C_{2} \frac{1+x^{3}}{\sigma}
$$

and

$$
\left|\log \frac{P\left(W_{n}^{\prime} \leq-x\right)}{\Phi(-x)}\right| \leq C_{2} \frac{1+x^{3}}{\sigma}
$$

for all $0 \leq x \leq C_{1} \sigma$.
(2) Berry-Esseen bounds: We obtain the following bounds:

$$
\sup _{x \in \mathbb{R}}\left|P\left(W_{n}^{\prime} \leq x\right)-\Phi(x)\right| \leq C(\log n)^{-1 / 2}
$$

(3) Moderate deviations principle: For any sequence $\left(a_{n}\right)_{n}$ of real numbers such that $1 \ll a_{n} \ll \sigma$ the sequences $\left(\frac{1}{a_{n}} W_{n}^{\prime}\right)_{n}$ satisfy a MDP with speed $a_{n}^{2}$ and rate function $I(x)=\frac{x^{2}}{2}$ (universaly true for $W_{n} ; 4$ moment match).

## moderate deviations for the largest eigenvalue

$\lambda_{\text {max }}$ largest GUE-eigenvalue distribution function of $n^{2 / 3}\left(\lambda_{\max }-2\right)$ converges to $F_{2}$ with

$$
F_{2}(s)=\operatorname{det}\left(I-A_{s}\right):
$$

Fredholm-determinant of the operator $A_{s}$ with kernel given in terms of Airy functions Ai by

$$
\frac{\operatorname{Ai}(x) \operatorname{Ai}^{\prime}(y)-\operatorname{Ai}^{\prime}(x) \operatorname{Ai}(y)}{x-y}
$$

## moderate deviations for the largest eigenvalue

$\lambda_{\text {max }}$ largest GUE-eigenvalue distribution function of $n^{2 / 3}\left(\lambda_{\max }-2\right)$ converges to $F_{2}$ with

$$
F_{2}(s)=\operatorname{det}\left(I-A_{s}\right):
$$

Fredholm-determinant of the operator $A_{s}$ with kernel given in terms of Airy functions Ai by

$$
\frac{\operatorname{Ai}(x) \operatorname{Ai}^{\prime}(y)-\operatorname{Ai}^{\prime}(x) \operatorname{Ai}(y)}{x-y}
$$

Asymptotics:

$$
\begin{gathered}
1-F_{2}(x) \sim \frac{e^{-(4 / 3) x^{3 / 2}}}{16 \pi x^{3 / 2}} \text { as } x \rightarrow \infty \\
\operatorname{Ai}(x) \sim \sin \left(2 / 3|x|^{3 / 2}+\frac{\pi}{4}\right) \text { as } x \rightarrow-\infty
\end{gathered}
$$

## moderate deviations for the largest eigenvalue

## Theorem (Th. Kriecherbauer, K. Schüler, P.E., 2014)

upper-tail moderate deviations for GUE: for any $0<\alpha<2 / 3$ and $y>0$

$$
\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\log P\left(\lambda_{\max } \geq 2+y n^{-\alpha}\right)}{n^{1-(3 / 2) \alpha}}=-\frac{4}{3} y^{3 / 2}
$$

upper-tail moderate deviations for $\lambda_{\text {max }}$ universal for invariant matrix ensembles

$$
P_{n, V}(\lambda)=\frac{1}{Z_{n, V}} \prod_{j<k}\left(\lambda_{k}-\lambda_{j}\right)^{2} \prod_{m=1}^{n} e^{-n V\left(\lambda_{m}\right)} d \lambda
$$

for nice $V$ : real analytic, convex, $\lim _{|x| \rightarrow \infty} V(x)=\infty \ldots$
lower-tail moderate deviations, conjecture:

$$
\lim _{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\log P\left(\lambda_{\max } \leq 2-y n^{-\alpha}\right)}{n^{2-3 \alpha}}=-\frac{1}{12} y^{3}
$$

## finer asymptotics

by the method of orthogonal polynomials, one can even get finer asymptotics:
Theorem (Th. Kriecherbauer, K. Schüler, P.E., 2014) upper-tail moderate deviations for $\lambda_{\text {max }}$ universal for invariant matrix ensembles: for any $0<\alpha<2 / 3$ and $y>0$
$\log P\left(\lambda_{\max } \geq 2+y n^{-\alpha}\right)=-\frac{4}{3} y^{3 / 2} n^{1-(3 / 2) \alpha}+\frac{\log \left(16 \pi s^{3 / 2} n^{1-(3 / 2) \alpha}\right)}{s^{3 / 2} n^{1-(3 / 2) \alpha}}+\mathcal{O}\left(\frac{s}{n^{\alpha}}\right)$.

Thank you for your attention!

## concentration of measure enters the 4 Moment Theorem

$P\left(\lambda_{i}\left(A_{n}\right) \in I\right) \approx \mathbb{E}\left(G\left(\lambda_{i}\left(A_{n}\right)\right)\right), \quad$ bump function
Lindeberg's replacement method:
fix all but one entry of $A_{n}$, say $z:=Z_{p q} \quad$ switch to $z^{\prime}=Z_{p q}^{\prime}$

$$
\mathbb{E} G\left(\lambda_{i}(z)\right)-\mathbb{E} G\left(\lambda_{i}\left(z^{\prime}\right)\right)=\mathbb{E}(F(z))-\mathbb{E}\left(F\left(z^{\prime}\right)\right)
$$

TAYLOR; first four moments of $z$ and $z^{\prime}$ match:

$$
\sup _{x}\left|F^{(v)}\right| \mathbb{E}\left(|z|^{5}+\left|z^{\prime}\right|^{5}\right)
$$

here: $\mathbb{E}\left(|z|^{5}+\left|z^{\prime}\right|^{5}\right)=O\left(n^{5 / 2}\right)$

## HADAMARD and delocalization

Hadamard-Variational formulas:

$$
\left|F^{k}(x)\right| \leq n^{-k+o(1)}
$$

hence

$$
\left|\mathbb{E} G\left(\lambda_{i}(z)\right)-\mathbb{E} G\left(\lambda\left(z^{\prime}\right)\right)\right|=\mathcal{O}\left(n^{-5 / 2+o(1)}\right)
$$

swap roughly $n^{2} / 2$ times:

$$
O\left(n^{-1 / 2+o(1)}\right)=o(1)
$$

## universality

Wigner-matrices:

$$
\left|\operatorname{card}\left\{\lambda_{\mathrm{i}} \in \mathrm{I}\right\}-\int_{\mathrm{I}} \varrho(\mathrm{x}) \mathrm{dx}\right| \ll \mathrm{N}|\mathrm{I}|
$$

for all intervals $I \subset \mathbb{R}$ with $|I| \gg 1 / n$. Erdös, Schlein, Yau, 2009.

## universality

Wigner-matrices:

$$
\left|\operatorname{card}\left\{\lambda_{\mathrm{i}} \in \mathrm{I}\right\}-\int_{\mathrm{I}} \varrho(\mathrm{x}) \mathrm{dx}\right| \ll \mathrm{N}|\mathrm{I}|
$$

for all intervals $I \subset \mathbb{R}$ with $|I| \gg 1 / n$.
Erdös, Schlein, Yau, 2009.

$$
\varrho^{-2} p_{n}^{(2)}\left(E+\frac{x_{1}}{n \varrho}, E+\frac{x_{2}}{n \varrho}\right) \approx \operatorname{det}\left(\frac{\sin \pi\left(x_{1}-x_{2}\right)}{\pi\left(x_{1}-x_{2}\right)}\right)^{2}
$$

for every $E$ in the bulk of the spectrum and $\varrho=\varrho(E)$
Erdös, Schlein, Yau and Tao, Vu, 2010/11

